Eclectic Approach to English Textbook for Eleventh Grade Students of Senior High School

Abstract: The objective of this study is to determine the effects and advantages of using an eclectic approach in English textbooks for the eleventh grade of Indonesian senior high school students. The study was designed using qualitative research methods, with the objective of generating descriptive data in the form of words, phrases, and sentences. The study found the effect of using an eclectic approach in an English textbook for the eleventh-grade students of the Islamic High School (MAN) 1 of Metro. The use of an eclectic approach enabled teachers to use conversation, forming study group, loud-speaker, game, and body movement at the appropriate moment and arrangement while delivering the material. Among the advantages of using this method is that it allows the teacher to make the material more interesting, vary the teaching, increase confidence in delivering material, and liven up the bilingual situation. In addition, eclectic approach allows students to understand the English material more easily and relax while learning English. The study found that the use of an eclectic approach in English textbooks for the eleventh-grade students in an Islamic senior high school (MAN) 1 of Metro has a significant impact on both teachers and students when it comes to teaching and learning English.

Abstrak: Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengetahui efek dan keuntungan dari penggunaan pendekatan eklektik dalam buku pelajaran bahasa Inggris untuk siswa SMA Indonesia kelas sebelas. Penelitian ini dirancang dengan menggunakan metode penelitian kualitatif, dengan tujuan menghasilkan data deskriptif berupa kata, frase, dan kalimat. Studi ini menemukan pengaruh penggunaan pendekatan eklektik dalam buku teks bahasa Inggris untuk siswa kelas XI MAN 1 Metro. Penggunaan pendekatan eklektik memungkinkan guru menggunakan percakapan, membentuk kelompok belajar, pengeras suara, permainan, dan gerakan tubuh pada momen dan pengaturan yang tepat saat menyampaikan materi. Di antara keuntungan menggunakan metode ini adalah memungkinkan guru membuat materi lebih menarik, variasi pengajaran, meningkatkan kepercayaan diri dalam menyampaikan materi, dan menghidupkan situasi bilingual. Selain itu, pendekatan eklektik memungkinkan siswa untuk memahami materi bahasa Inggris dengan lebih mudah dan santai saat belajar bahasa Inggris. Studi ini menemukan bahwa penggunaan pendekatan eklektik dalam buku teks bahasa Inggris...
Keywords: advantages; eclectic approach; English learning; senior high school.

INTRODUCTION

Learning methods evolved over time. The terms conventional methods and contemporary methods have been used in many researches on education. This is undeniably due to dissatisfaction with certain methods (Hismanoglu & Hismanoglu, 2010; Aldof et al., 2016). Each method evolved as a result of dissatisfaction with the shortcomings of the previous method. In reality, no method is faultless. Because the method's implementation is heavily influenced by teachers' and students' abilities, as well as the situations and conditions of the learning environment (Bada & Olusegun, 2015).

Traditional methods have not fully met the needs of learning innovation in order to improve learning quality. Traditional learning methods are still widely used in English classes (Jin, et al., 2021; Puspitarini & Hanif, 2019). Despite the fact that English has a variety of linguistic features, the learning model is relatively consistent (Richards, 2005; Finegan, 2014).

Language teaching methods must be integrated based on the classroom environment and student abilities (Hwang & Fu, 2019). The eclectic approach can incorporate all language teaching methods. Eclectic can be defined as a combination in which the approach was a way to present foreign language learning materials in front of the class through various combinations of methods, such as direct method with grammar-translation method or reading method, as well as being used or applied in a teaching condition (Hwang & Fu, 2019). The primary objective of this eclectic approach is to support foreign language teachers' creativity in order to enhance the efficiency of teaching and learning foreign languages (Iscan, 2017; Mwanza, 2017a). This approach also allows them to adapt the approach to the learning objectives.

Essentially, teaching establishes the conditions for learning. Teaching is the process of passing on knowledge to students. Many considerations must be made during the process regarding the strategies, approaches, techniques, and methods used for teaching to be carried out optimally and time allocation to be used effectively (Heller & Hollabaugh, 1992). The teacher must truly prepare students to be motivated and inspired to learn. The teacher must then maintain the students' attention throughout the learning process. The information must be presented in a way that is enjoyable and simple for students to understand (Hashemi & Azidinezhad, 2011; Srichanyachon, 2012).

As teaching grammar is a challenging task, and to cope with teaching those activities, effective teaching techniques are then required. Similarly, Direct Method, Grammar-Translation Method, Communicative Language Teaching, and Audio-lingual Method are all popular methods (Kegeyan, 2016). One method may be preferred or more useful than another in some cases. There is no such thing as a perfect method because all methods have flaws and strengths. It is critical to learn and practice different teaching methods in order to determine which method is best for each individual. Therefore, teaching and learning can coexist (Rao, 2018).

A textbook is one of the learning materials which are typically written well-organized and concise. The majority of the information used in the classroom comes from textbooks. That is why textbooks become essential in classroom teaching. English textbooks can be the main source by which students learn English in the classroom. Teachers frequently used handbooks as their primary book, source of ideas, and source of educational activities,
and they provide guidance on what to do. Similarly, in Indonesia, textbooks are required in all schools to support the learning process, as stated in Decree of the Minister of Education, Culture, Research and Technology of the Republic of Indonesia Number 56 2022 Article 12 (Kemendikbud-Ristek, 2022), which implies that teachers can recommend students who are able to have a textbook. In other words, the government strongly suggests that each learner have a textbook in order to complete the learning process.

Teachers require a variety of learning methods because learning is based on assumptions about the problems faced by most teachers with an orientation to learning English, which is not always one objective, but can also be numerous objectives. If teachers have multiple learning objectives in mind, they must understand and master the characteristics of each method so that they can combine the use of several of these methods at the same time to achieve some of the objectives (cf. Kennedy, et al., 2006; Sudargini, & Purwanto, 2020). We assumed that several types of teaching methods or approaches exist in an English for high school for 11th graders textbook published in 2017 by the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia, which require further investigation to understand what methods are used and in what type of classroom situation that the textbook might be effectively used.

There were relevant previously studied topics on eclectic method use in learning and teaching language, from articles across many subjects. One of them is the English textbooks for Junior High School students with 34 teachers from East and West Azerbaijan using an eclectic checklist. The study found that the aspects that needs the most improvement are pronunciation, task, and activities (Shahmohammadi, 2018). Subsequent study by Joy (2022) who has used a mixed method (eclectic) to explain disagreements between teachers on what they believe in and what is in textbook to provide a comprehensive discussion on the positive and negative aspects that teachers believe in the textbook. Furthermore, in his study (Mwanza, 2017b) eclectic approach is a hybrid that should be viewed as one method that combines elements of different methods after conducting a study with 90 secondary school English teachers in Zambia. Furthermore, some teachers mistook the eclectic approach for the sequential use of multiple methods in a lesson. The eclectic and comprehension methods were used to study the weak students in English learning, it was found that more weak students improved significantly, particularly in terms of vocabulary acquisition from listening to stories (Mason, 2018). Current study examined at an eclectic approach in an English textbook for the eleventh grade in Islamic senior high school (MAN) 1 of Metro city. The eclectic approach in teaching and learning process in English textbook for eleventh grade of Indonesian senior high schools is thus the focus of this research. Based on the aforementioned, the study seeks to understand the effects of using eclectic approach and advantages of using eclectic approach in English textbook for eleventh grade of the senior high school of Indonesia.

**METHOD**

This study was designed using a qualitative research design. The data was analyzed descriptively rather than numerically as in quantitative research, which was used to gather information about an observable phenomenon and the state at the time the research was conducted (Leavy, 2017). The purpose of descriptive research is to obtain information systematically, factually, and accurately (Cresswell, 2003). This study aimed at determining the use of the eclectic approach in English textbook used by eleventh grade students in the Islamic High School (MAN) 1 of Metro, Metro City, Lampung Province. In this study, the documentation method was
applied to data source in the form of words, phrase and sentences of the English textbook for senior high school students (Bahasa Inggris untuk SMA) written by Mahrukh Bashir, used by 11th graders published in 2017 by the ministry of education and culture of the Republic of Indonesia. The textbook being analyzed in this study containing 8 chapters. Further method used to collect the data is interviews with the teachers and students. In this case, the researcher used a structured interview, where an interviewee determines the problem and questions to find answers on hypotheses that are tightly arranged (structured). In building trustworthiness in this research, the researchers provided a set of evidence by providing some pictures in analyzing the textbook.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
Results
The researchers used a checklist to analyze materials in an English textbook used by eleventh grade students in senior high school published by the Republic of Indonesia’s Ministry of Education and Culture. The checklist included the following methods: direct method, grammar translation method, audiolingual method, suggestopedia, community language learning method, and total physical response method. The elements are explained further below. The aspects and teaching methods used to analyze the English textbook used by eleventh grade senior high school students. Each criterion has some criteria that must be met in order for an eclectic approach to be considered:

Table 1. Analysis of Handbook Chapters of the English textbook for Eleventh Grade students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Method</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Offers &amp; Suggestions</th>
<th>Questions at Start of Text</th>
<th>Grammar Translation Method</th>
<th>Dialogues</th>
<th>Short paragraphs for necessary information of background words</th>
<th>Partial rules of grammar included</th>
<th>Total Physical Response Method</th>
<th>Dialogue</th>
<th>Conversation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direct Method</td>
<td>Students were given the target language.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grammar Translation Method</td>
<td>Students are treated as apprentices.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dialogues</td>
<td>Students were asked to make suggestions.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conversation</td>
<td>Students were asked to suggest ways to improve.</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first chapter is titled "Offers & Suggestions." The students were divided into several groups in the circle-arranged chair to practice the dialogue before speaking in front of the class. The teacher serves as a facilitator, establishing relationships between students. This material implements the goal of practicing offers and suggestions to improve students’ speaking skills. Therefore, the materials in this chapter with an objective aspect meet the criteria of the community language learning method.

Students were given vocabulary related to offers and suggestions. They were asked to provide Indonesian translations of the words in order to comprehend the purpose of the material. The exercise involves replacing missing words in sentences. This material carries out the objectives of knowing the vocabularies of offers and suggestions in order to train students’ grammar skills. Additionally, the effect of using an eclectic approach as the learning method was seen in conversation and study groups, the teachers acted as the
facilitator and the material translated into Indonesia to comprehend the material's objectives, in Chapter 1 "offers and suggestions." The material used a community language learning and grammar translation method. Two approaches were used in the material. The material was considered to employ an eclectic approach since it uses more than one method.

The material met the criteria for criteria as an objective, as it clearly stated the method's features. Thus, the objective components of analysis in this chapter meet the criteria of the grammar translation method. Based on the above explanation, the effect of using an eclectic approach in chapter 2 "opinions and thoughts" is the use of a loudspeaker as a learning tool and material translated into Indonesia to comprehend the material's objectives. The audiolingual and grammar translation methods are used in the material. This concludes that the material used two methods and considered to have applied an eclectic approach.

The following material is about "grammar of natural disasters—an expositions," and in this chapter the aspect of grammar translation method is met. Students are given exposition text grammar. To understand the purpose of the material, the students translated each expression from English into Indonesian. The teacher helps the students in understanding the material by explaining it in Indonesian and providing examples of each word. This material carries out the objective of knowing the language aspect of an exposition text in order to train students' grammar skills. Thus, the materials analysis from an objective perspective in this chapter meets the grammar translation method's criteria.

Suggestopedia is the second method used in this chapter. The teacher can use the game after difficult grammar material to help students relax for a few minutes before moving on to the next material. The arrangement of chairs can be changed so that learning takes place in a more pleasant environment. The teacher motivates students to learn more in class. The teacher should make the students more interested in the material and make them feel relaxed while learning. Bearing in mind that student interest is the most important factor in determining the level of student learning activity. Thus, interest is a factor that influences student involvement in learning (Panigrahi et al., 2020).

The findings of using an eclectic approach in chapter 7's "meaning through music" include the translation of the text into Indonesian for the purpose of helping understand it, the use of a loudspeaker as a teaching tool, and the translation of all speeches and instructions into actions. The content employs the total physical response method, grammar translation method, and audiolingual method. It is clear that the text employs three strategies. Due to the material's eclectic approach and use of various methods.

Conversation based on the provided topics is what the material is. The skill that students will acquire is speaking ability. The component of learning a language in a community is
thus satisfied in this chapter. In addition, conversational samples were given to the students, who then practice them in front of the class. Before practicing the dialogue in front of the class, the students were divided into a number of groups and seated in a circle. The teacher served as a link between the students. This material incorporates the objective of using conversation practice to improve students' speaking abilities. As a result, the objective materials in this chapter meet the specifications of the community language learning method.

The result of using an eclectic approach in Chapter 8 "explain this" is that the material is translated into Indonesia to understand the purpose of the material, study groups are used as the learning method, the teacher serves as the facilitator, and English is used to explain the material. The material uses the community language learning method, the grammar translation method, and the total direct method. It is possible to conclude that the material uses three methods. The material takes an eclectic approach because it uses more than one method.

**The advantages of using eclectic approach**

Based on the explored findings, the researchers discovered the merit of an eclectic approach. Because each chapter contains different material and methods to use, the benefits of an eclectic approach will be explained chapter by chapter in this section.

a. Chapter 1: Offers and Suggestion

In this chapter, the eclectic approach helps the teachers in making the material more interesting by allowing students to share the material with their friends rather than listening to the teacher's explanation until the end of class. The student will also understand the material better because it has been translated into Indonesian. To make material transfer easier, the teacher can translate the explanation.

b. Chapter 2: Opinions and Thoughts

In this chapter, the eclectic approach allows the teacher to be more confident in delivering material by implementing an audiolingual tool that engages students in a different method of learning. The teacher can also deliver the material more quickly because it has been translated into Indonesian. To help students understand, the teacher can translate the explanation.

c. Chapter 3: Party Time

In this chapter, the eclectic approach helps the teacher live up to the bilingual situation by explaining the lesson in all English. Therefore, students can gain direct experience with listening and speaking in class. The teacher can also make the material more interesting by allowing students to share it with their friends rather than listening to the teacher's explanation until the end of class.

d. Chapter 4: National Disaster-An Exposition

The eclectic approach helps students enjoy more while learning English because of the use of games after difficult material in this chapter. As a result, the student can take a short break before returning to the next material provided by the teacher. The teacher can also deliver the material more quickly because the material has been translated into Indonesia.

e. Chapter 5: Letter Writing

In this chapter, the eclectic approach helps the teacher live up to the bilingual situation by explaining the lesson in all English. As a result,
students gain firsthand experience with listening and speaking in class. The teacher can also make the material easier to understand by translating difficult words into Indonesian. To help students understand, the teacher can translate the explanation.

f. Chapter 6: Cause and Effect
This chapter provides an introduction to the vocabulary of cause and effect. To fully grasp the material's purpose, the students translated the word into Indonesian. The teacher helps students understand the material by explaining it in Indonesian and providing examples for each word. The teacher serves as a facilitator, assisting students in making ties with one another. The main objective of this material is for students to practice cause and effect conversations in order to improve their language skills.

g. Chapter 7: Meaning through Music
In this chapter, the eclectic approach allows the teacher to be more confident in delivering material by using an audiolingual device that captivates the student's interest in the alternative method of learning. Because the material has been translated into Indonesia, the teacher can also deliver the material more quickly. The teacher can translate the explanation to help students better comprehend. The teacher can also vary the method of instruction by translating speeches and instructions into action and using more body movements.

h. Chapter 8: Explain This!
This chapter's eclectic approach helps the teacher in enlivening the bilingual situation by explaining the lesson entirely in English. Thus, students can gain practical learning experience in class by listening and speaking. The teacher can also aid students' comprehension by translating difficult words into Indonesian. To help students understand, the teacher can translate the explanation. The teacher can also make the material more interesting by allowing students to share it with their peers rather than having them wait until the end of class to hear the teacher's explanation.

Discussion
Eclectic method combines the best features of various language learning methods. The steps of using this eclectic method vary greatly depending on the teacher's selection and combining pattern, which is also not uniform. This means that the mother tongue can be used to provide explanations and translations as needed in this method to speed up the teaching process, avoid misunderstandings, and save time. When necessary, translations are provided, grammar is taught deductively, and some audio-visual aids are used to help the learning. Teachers rarely used a single method of instruction because they fully comprehend that each method has advantages and disadvantages. When one method was used, students are more likely to experience boring teaching and learning activities. Student learning activities are trapped by boredom and laziness, and students were less enthusiastic about learning. Therefore, using appropriate and diverse methods can entice students to participate in school teaching and learning activities (Kuh, 2003).

Learning materials are essential components of teaching and learning.
activities because they are what students are attempting to master (Sweller & Chandler, 1994). Thus, teachers in particular, or curriculum developers in general, should not overlook the extent to which the materials listed in the syllabus relate to the needs of students at a specific age and in a particular setting. Relevant to this study, there were found some advantages of using an eclectic approach in the English textbook for the eleventh grade at Metro City's Islamic Senior High School (MAN) 1. The selected materials enabled teachers to deliver subject in a more interesting ways, in which they were proved to help providing teachers in varying the teaching, help teachers in being more confident in delivering material; help teachers in livening up the situation of bilingual area; help students in understanding the material more easily; help students in being more relaxed in learning English. In fact, it should be noted that the eclectic method is the best approach if it is supported by the teacher’s sufficient proficiency with diverse approaches (cf. Rifa’i, 2015; Munawwir, 2020).

The findings of this study showed that the English textbook used in the 11th grade of senior high school, published by the Republic of Indonesia’s Ministry of Education and Culture, used an eclectic approach because the material employs more than one method and has been shown to have some positive effects and benefits. The book focuses on English skills such as speaking, listening, writing, and reading. The method used in teaching and learning is related to the material and the teacher's decision. This is similar to previous similar studies (Mwanza, 2017; Jose, & Dufrene, 2014), which found that using an eclectic method makes teaching and learning activities more interesting because they are diverse and not focused on a single activity. Thus, such combination is expected to inspire students to learn English.

CONCLUSION

Eclectic method is identical to any other method. It was envisioned with some advantages and disadvantages. Each advantage of this approach is that when it is supported by appropriate teacher professionalism in enriching teaching techniques, its strength will gradually be refined to be applied proportionately. However, this eclectic approach becomes erratic and what is known as a makeshift approach will appear if it is not supported by professional methodological competition from instructors in the classroom. The use of an eclectic approach impacts teachers to present material using conversation, study groups, loudspeakers, games, and physical movements at the appropriate time and place. Using an eclectic approach helped teachers in delivering the material more engagingly, adding more variety to the classroom, increasing their confidence, and livening up the environment in bilingual areas. The benefits of an eclectic approach also help students understand the material more easily and feel more relaxed while learning English. The eclectic approach was used, and it has some good benefits and effects in teaching and learning English.

REFERENCES
International Symposium on Workload Characterization (IISWC) (pp. 1-10). IEEE.


